

Table of Contents

Preface	V
Selected Bibliography	XV
List of Authors.....	XVII

Introduction (*Paulus*)

A. General overview; structure.....	1
I. The goals of the Directive	1
II. Structure.....	3
B. Historical development	4
C. Relationship to EU 2015/848; cross-border issues.....	6
D. Global positioning of the new instrument.....	7

DIRECTIVE (EU) 2019/1023 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL.....	9
--	----------

Title I General Provisions

Article 1. Subject matter and scope (<i>Dammann</i>)	35
A. Purpose	36
B. Proceedings and measures falling within the scope of the Directive	37
I. Preventive restructuring frameworks	37
1. The development of hybrid, preventive, semi-collective restructuring proceedings.....	37
2. The approach of the Directive.....	37
3. The exclusion of classical insolvency proceedings from the scope of the Directive.....	39
4. Judicial composition versus court-assisted contractual approach.....	41
5. Transposition by amending existing preventive insolvency proceedings.....	42
6. The two-step approach	43
II. Proceedings leading to a discharge of debts	45
III. Measures to increase the efficiency of procedures concerning the restructuring, insolvency and discharge of debt	45
C. Group of companies	46
D. Excluded classes of debtors	46
E. Excluded categories of claims	48
F. Possibility to limit preventive restructuring framework to financial restructuring?.....	49
G. The size of the debtors	50
H. The relationship between the Directive, the EIR 2015 and Brussels Ia.....	50
I. Cross-border aspects of preventive restructurings	50
II. The relationship between the Directive and the EIR 2015	51
III. The scope of the EIR 2015.....	51
IV. The scope of the EIR 2015 in light of the Directive.....	52
V. The consequence of the application of the EIR 2015 to restructuring frameworks.....	55
VI. The advantage of the two-step model.....	56
VII. The application of Brussels Ia.....	56
VIII. The relationship between the Directive and the Transfer Directive.....	58
Article 2. Definitions.....	59
A. Purpose of the norm (<i>Paulus</i>)	60
B. Definitions.....	61
I. lit. 1: Restructuring (<i>Dammann</i>).....	61
II. lit. 2: Affected parties (<i>Veder</i>).....	63

III. lit. 3: Equity holder (<i>Garcimartin</i>).....	64
IV. lit. 4: Stay of individual enforcement actions (<i>Richter</i>).....	64
V. lit. 5: Executory contract (<i>Richter</i>).....	67
VI. lit. 6: Best-interest-of-creditors test (<i>Veder</i>).....	68
VII. lit. 7: New financing (<i>Lynch Fannon</i>).....	69
VIII. lit. 8: Interim financing (<i>Lynch Fannon</i>).....	71
IX. lit. 9: Entrepreneur (<i>Paulus</i>).....	74
X. lit. 10: Full discharge of debt (<i>Paulus</i>).....	75
XI. lit. 11: Repayment plan (<i>Paulus</i>).....	75
XII. lit. 12: Practitioner in the field of restructuring (<i>Veder</i>).....	76
C. Par. 2 (<i>Paulus</i>).....	76
I. Insolvency.....	77
II. Likelihood of insolvency.....	77
III. Micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (“SMEs”).....	77
Article 3. Early warning and access to information (<i>Rammeskow</i>).....	78
A. Purpose of the norm.....	78
B. Duty of Member States to establish early warning tools.....	79
C. Should early warning tools also apply to consumers etc.?.....	79
D. Which early warning tools must be available?.....	80
I. Alert mechanisms.....	80
II. Advisory services.....	81
III. Directors’ duties to act upon an early warning.....	82
E. Information to employee representatives on early warning tools.....	83
F. Easy accessible online information about early warning tools.....	83
G. Support to employees’ representatives.....	83

Title II
Preventive Restructuring Frameworks

Chapter 1. Availability of preventive restructuring frameworks.....	85
Article 4. Availability of preventive restructuring frameworks (<i>Garcimartin</i>).....	85
A. Purpose.....	86
B. Structure.....	87
C. Availability of preventive restructuring frameworks.....	87
I. Introduction.....	87
II. Preventive restructuring frameworks.....	87
III. The likelihood-of-insolvency test.....	89
D. Suspicious debtors.....	91
E. Viability test.....	92
F. Number of times.....	93
G. Procedural aspects.....	94
I. General aspects.....	94
II. Minimum intervention of judicial or administrative authorities.....	95
H. Initiative.....	96
Chapter 2. Facilitating negotiations on preventive restructuring plans.....	97
Article 5. Debtor in possession (<i>Veder</i>).....	97
A. Purpose of the norm.....	97
B. Debtor-in-possession.....	98
C. Appointment of a practitioner in the field of restructuring.....	100
I. General remarks.....	100
II. Discretion.....	101
III. Mandatory appointment.....	101
D. Practitioner in the field of restructuring.....	102
Article 6. Stay of individual enforcement actions (<i>Richter</i>).....	103
A. General comments.....	105
B. Specific parameters of the stay.....	105

I. The specific purpose of the stay (Article 6 par. 1 1 st subparagraph).....	105
II. Official discretion at the point of entry (Article 6 par. 1 2 nd subparagraph).....	106
III. The claims subject – and not the subject – of the stay (Article 6 par. 2).....	107
IV. The nature of the stay (Article 6 par. 3 1 st subparagraph).....	109
V. The limited stay (Article 6 par. 3 2 nd subparagraph).....	109
VI. Claims which Member States may exempt from the stay (Article 6 par. 4).....	110
1. The two general pre-requirements.....	110
2. The two specific conditions.....	111
a) Enforcement not likely to jeopardise the restructuring (Article 6 par. 4 lit. a).....	112
b) Unfair prejudice (Article 6 par. 4 lit. b).....	114
3. The procedural context.....	115
VII. Employees' claims (Article 6 par. 5).....	116
VIII. The initial duration of the stay (Article 6 par. 6).....	117
IX. Extensions and renewals (Article 6 par. 7).....	117
X. Limitations on the overall duration of the stay (Article 6 par. 8).....	119
XI. Termination of the stay via official discretion (Article 6 par. 9).....	120
1. A stay litigation standstill period.....	120
2. An opportunity to be heard.....	120
3. The grounds for lifting the stay.....	121
C. The debtor's powers and duties during the stay.....	123
Article 7. Consequences of the stay of individual enforcement actions (<i>Richter</i>).....	124
A. General comments.....	126
B. Specific rules related to the stay.....	126
I. Commencement of formal insolvency proceedings.....	126
1. Suspension of the debtor's duty to file (Article 7 par. 1).....	126
2. Suspension of the creditors' right to file (Article 7 par. 2).....	127
3. Derogations from the safe-harbours (Article 7 par. 3).....	128
II. The debtor's contracts.....	130
1. Preservation of essential executory contracts (Article 7 par. 4 1 st subparagraph).....	130
a) What is the prohibition?.....	130
b) When does the prohibition apply?.....	131
c) What does the prohibition apply to?.....	132
d) Against whom the prohibition applies.....	133
e) For how long does the prohibition apply?.....	134
2. Safeguards awarded to the debtor's counterparties (Article 7 par. 4 2 nd subparagraph).....	134
3. Extension of the prohibition to non-essential contracts (Article 7 par. 4 3 rd subparagraph).....	135
4. <i>Ipsa facto</i> clauses (Article 7 par. 5).....	135
5. The ultimate fate of the debtor's contracts.....	137
III. Netting arrangements (Article 7 par. 6).....	138
IV. Expiry of the stay (Article 7 par. 7).....	139
V. Set-off.....	140
Chapter 3. Restructuring plans	141
Article 8. Content of restructuring plans (<i>Veder</i>).....	141
A. Purpose of the norm.....	142
B. Minimum content of the plan.....	142
I. Information regarding the (financial situation of the) debtor.....	142
II. Affected parties.....	143
III. Terms of the plan.....	144
IV. Statement relating to the prospects of the restructuring.....	145
C. Checklists.....	145
D. Third-party releases.....	145
Article 9. Adoption of restructuring plans (<i>Dammann</i>).....	146
A. Introduction.....	148
B. Preliminary remark: the concept of 'affected parties'.....	149

I. The legal framework.....	149
II. The choice for the proposer of the plan to carve out unaffected parties	151
C. Submission of restructuring plans, Article 9 par. 1	153
I. The submission of the restructuring plan by the debtor.....	153
II. The submission of the restructuring plan by the practitioner in the field of restructuring	154
III. The submission of competing restructuring plans by creditors.....	154
D. Voting rights, Article 9 par. 2 and 3	155
E. Classes of creditors, Article 9 par. 4 and 5	156
I. The rationale of class formation.....	156
II. Equity holders.....	157
III. The constitution of additional classes	158
IV. The question of mixing up secured and unsecured creditors within the same class.....	160
V. The option to create a separate class for workers' claims	161
VI. The protection of vulnerable creditors	161
VII. The single class option for SMEs	161
VIII. The control of the formation of classes and voting rights by a judicial or administrative authority.....	162
F. Voting Majorities, Article 9 par. 6.....	164
I. Rational of majority rules	164
II. The flexible approach of the Directive.....	164
III. Best practice	165
IV. The calculation of the voting rights.....	165
G. Agreement with the requisite majority, Article 9 par. 7.....	166
Article 10. Confirmation of restructuring plans (<i>Garcimartin</i>).....	167
A. Purpose	168
B. Need of confirmation	168
C. Conditions.....	170
I. Adoption of the plan.....	170
II. Unfair discrimination test.....	171
III. Notification of the plan.....	172
IV. Best-interest-of-creditors test	172
V. New financing.....	174
VI. Burden of allegation	175
D. Viability and Insolvency tests	175
E. Procedure.....	175
Article 11. Cross-class cram-down (<i>Veder</i>)	176
A. Purpose of the norm	177
B. Cross-class cram-down.....	177
C. Request for confirmation by the debtor or with the debtor's agreement.....	180
D. Conditions for confirmation of a non-consensual plan	183
I. General confirmation conditions	183
II. Minimum support test.....	183
III. The fairness test.....	184
1. Relative priority rule	185
2. Absolute priority rule	187
E. Practitioner in the field of restructuring	189
Article 12. Equity holders (<i>Garcimartin</i>).....	189
A. Purpose	190
B. Structure.....	191
C. Definition of equity holders	191
D. Alternatives	192
I. Introduction: legal background.....	192
II. Equity holders as a class of affected parties.....	193
III. Other means.....	195
IV. SMEs	197
V. Cross-border scenarios	198

Article 13. Workers (<i>Lynch Fannon</i>).....	198
A. Purpose	199
B. Emergence of Article 13 in the legislative development of the Directive.....	201
C. Purpose	201
D. Interface with other EU employment legislation	202
I. Information and consultation	202
II. Additional Directives which interface with restructuring	204
III. Guarantee of payments of wages, salaries and pension	205
IV. Acquired Rights Directive	206
V. New consultation rights.....	208
E. Alternative restructuring proposals, frameworks and approaches.....	208
Article 14. Valuation by the judicial or administrative authority (<i>Dammann</i>).....	209
A. Purpose	209
B. The valuation of the business as a going concern	210
C. The liquidation value of the business	211
D. Judicial valuation only where the plan is challenged	212
E. The procedure to lodge a challenge	212
F. The appointment of experts.....	213
G. Best practice for the transposition of Article 14 of the Directive.....	214
Article 15. Effects of restructuring plans (<i>Richter</i>).....	214
A. The effects of restructuring plans	214
I. Binding effects on affected parties (Article 15 par. 1).....	214
II. Creditors not involved in the adoption of the plan, par. 2.....	215
Article 16. Appeals (<i>Paulus</i>).....	216
A. Purpose	216
B. Appeal	217
I. Possibility to appeal, par. 1.....	217
1. Judicial authority.....	217
2. Administrative authority.....	218
II. Procedural steps, par. 2 and 3.....	218
III. Decision, par. 4.....	219
Chapter 4. Protection for new financing, interim financing and other restructuring related transactions	220
Article 17. Protection for new financing and interim financing (<i>Lynch Fannon</i>).....	220
A. Introduction.....	221
B. History.....	222
C. Purpose	224
D. Protection for new and interim financing	224
I. The applicability of measures which might render new and interim financing ‘void, avoidable or unenforceable’	224
II. Where liability might be incurred in relation to new and interim financing.....	226
III. Interim financing granted after the debtor is unable to pay its debts as they fall due	227
E. Priority for new and interim financing	228
F. Conclusion.....	228
Article 18. Protection for other restructuring related transactions (<i>Lynch Fannon</i>)	229
A. Purpose and background	230
B. The scope of Article 18: introduction.....	231
C. The scope of the Article: specific provisions.....	232
I. Transactions which are “reasonable and immediately necessary”.....	232
II. Specifically enumerated protected transactions	232
III. Timing of Transactions during the negotiation phase.....	233
IV. Transactions entered into during the implementation phase.....	234
D. Implementation of Article 18 – The role of the judiciary and or administrative authority ...	234

E. Protection from actions or measures which render the transactions void, voidable or unenforceable.....	235
I. Other transactions or commitments which are relevant	236
II. Practical Issues.....	237
Chapter 5. Duties of directors.....	238
Article 19. Duties of directors where there is a likelihood of insolvency (<i>Corno</i>).....	238
A. Purpose of Article 19 and of the implementing Member States' rules	238
B. Ambit of application	239
C. Duties of directors as one of the minimum standards for preventive restructuring procedure	240
D. The long way to Article 19.....	242
E. Issues to be imposed on directors by Member States as a minimum	243
I. Interests of creditors, equity holders and other stakeholders.....	243
1. Need to have regard to interests of stakeholders.....	243
2. The possible extension to rights of stakeholders	244
3. Interests of creditors	244
4. Interests of equity holders	245
5. Interest of other stakeholders. Directors' interests	246
II. Need to take steps to minimize losses and avoid insolvency.....	246
III. Need to avoid deliberate or grossly negligent conduct that threatens the viability of the business	247

Title III

Discharge of Debt and Disqualifications

Article 20. Access to discharge (<i>Paulus</i>).....	249
A. Purpose	249
B. Access to full discharge, par. 1	250
C. Proportionality, par. 2	251
D. Fresh start, par. 3.....	252
Article 21. Discharge period (<i>Paulus</i>)	252
A. Purpose	253
B. Start of discharge period, par. 1.....	253
C. End of discharge period, par. 2	254
D. Permissible side effect, par. 3.....	255
Article 22. Disqualification period (<i>Rammeskow</i>).....	255
A. Purpose of the norm.....	255
B. Article 22 concerns entrepreneurs	256
C. Which kinds of disqualifications must cease according to Article 22.....	257
D. Disqualifications concerning specially supervised activities	258
E. When must a disqualification cease.....	258
F. No requirement for additional procedures to cease a disqualification	259
Article 23. Derogations (<i>Rammeskow</i>).....	259
A. Purpose of the norm.....	261
B. Entrepreneurs that have acted dishonestly or in bad faith.....	261
C. Derogations in other well-defined circumstances	262
I. Violation of obligations under the repayment plan etc.....	262
II. Failure to comply with information or cooperation duties	263
III. Abusive applications for discharge	263
IV. Limitation of further applications for discharge.....	263
V. The cost of the procedure leading to the discharge of debt is not covered	263
VI. Safeguarding the balance between the rights of the debtor and the rights of one or more creditors.....	264
D. Longer discharge period.....	264
I. Longer discharge period in order to preserve the entrepreneur's business.....	264
II. Longer discharge period where the entrepreneur's main residence is not realised.....	265

E. Exclusion of certain categories of debt from the discharge.....	266
F. Longer disqualification periods for certain professions.....	267
I. Professions with specific rules on ethics, reputation or expertise.....	267
II. Professions dealing with the management of the property of others.....	268
III. Par. 5 apply despite a discharge.....	268
IV. Par. 5 merely concerns the disqualification period.....	268
G. Disqualifications ordered by other authorities.....	268
Article 24. Consolidation of proceedings regarding professional and personal debts (<i>Richter</i>)..	269
A. General comments.....	270
B. Specific rules related to consolidation of proceedings.....	271
I. Inseparable debts (Article 24 par. 1).....	271
II. Separable debts (Article 24 par. 2).....	271

Title IV

Measures to increase the efficiency of the procedures concerning restructuring, insolvency and discharge of debt

Article 25. Judicial and administrative authorities (<i>Corno</i>).....	273
A. Purpose of Title IV.....	273
B. Scope of Article 25.....	274
I. Content and reasons of its text.....	274
II. Measures regarding judicial and administrative authorities, when dealing with procedures concerning restructuring, insolvency and discharge of debt (Article 25 par. 1, lit. a).....	275
III. Measures regarding procedures concerning restructuring, insolvency and discharge of debt (Article 25 par. 1, lit. b).....	276
C. Limits to the application of measures set by Article 25.....	277
D. Ambit of application of the measures set by Article 25.....	277
I. Measures set by Article 25, par. 1, lit. a.....	277
II. Measures set by Article 25, par. 1, lit. b.....	278
Article 26. Practitioners in procedures concerning restructuring, insolvency and discharge of debt (<i>Veder</i>).....	278
A. Purpose of the norm.....	279
B. Training and expertise.....	280
C. Eligibility.....	281
D. Appointment, removal and resignation.....	281
E. Objections.....	282
F. Best Practices.....	282
Article 27. Supervision and remuneration of practitioners (<i>Veder</i>).....	283
A. Purpose of the norm.....	283
B. Supervision.....	283
C. Codes of conduct.....	284
D. Remuneration.....	285
Article 28. Use of electronic means of communication (<i>Paulus</i>).....	285

Title V

Monitoring of Procedures Concerning Restructuring, Insolvency and Discharge of Debt

Article 29. Data collection (<i>Richter</i>).....	287
A. General comments.....	288
B. The data to be collected.....	289
I. A dataset of restructurings and insolvencies (Article 29 par. 1).....	289
II. Repeat filers (Article 29 par. 2).....	289
III. Further data to be collected voluntarily (Article 29 par. 3).....	290
IV. Breakdowns of the data collected (Article 29 par. 4).....	290
V. Working with samples (Article 29 par. 5).....	291

VI. Reporting periods, the communication form and presentation of the national data (Article 29 par. 6 to 8).....	291
Article 30. Committee procedure (<i>Paulus</i>)	291

Title VI
Final Provisions

Article 31. Relationship with other acts and international instruments (<i>Paulus</i>).....	293
Article 32. Amendment of Directive (EU) 2017/1132 (<i>Paulus</i>).....	294
Article 33. Review clause (<i>Paulus</i>)	294
Article 34. Transposition (<i>Paulus</i>)	295
Article 35. Entry into force.....	296
Article 36.	297