

# Protecting and Enforcing Life Science Inventions in Europe

under EPC and EU Law - From Antibodies to Zebrafish

von

Dr. rer. nat. Franz-Josef Zimmer, Steven Zeman, Steven M. Zeman, Dr. Jens Hammer, Dr.-Ing. Klara Goldbach, Dr.  
Bernd Allekotte

2nd edition, completely revised and updated



Verlag C.H. Beck München 2015

Verlag C.H. Beck im Internet:

[www.beck.de](http://www.beck.de)

ISBN 978 3 406 47351 7

## Table of Contents

Preface to the second edition . . . . .	V
Abbreviations . . . . .	XVII
<b>A. Life Science Matter . . . . .</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>A.I. Summary of historical development . . . . .</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>A.II. Definition of life science matter . . . . .</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>B. Legal Provisions . . . . .</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>B.I. European Patent Convention (EPC) . . . . .</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>B.II. EU Law . . . . .</b>	<b>5</b>
B.II.1. EU Biotech Directive and its Implementation into the EPC . . . . .	5
B.II.2. EU Regulations Concerning the Creation of a Supplementary Protection Certificate (SPC) for Medicinal Products (MSPC), Pediatric Extension of Duration for Medicinal Products (PE) and Plant Protection Products (PSPC) . . . . .	5
B.II.3. Council Regulation on Community Plant Variety Rights (CPVR) . . . . .	6
B.II.4. EU Bolar Directive . . . . .	6
<b>C. General Aspects on Protection . . . . .</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>C.I. Protection under the EPC . . . . .</b>	<b>7</b>
C.I.1. Non-patentable matter . . . . .	7
C.I.1.a. Discoveries . . . . .	7
C.I.2. Exceptions to patentability . . . . .	9
C.I.2.a. Inventions contrary to “ordre public” or morality . . . . .	9
C.I.2.b. Plant and animal varieties . . . . .	14
C.I.2.b.a. Plant Varieties . . . . .	14
C.I.2.b.b. Animal Varieties . . . . .	15
C.I.2.c. Essentially biological processes for the production of plants or animals . . . . .	16
C.I.2.d. Methods for treatment of the human or animal body by surgery or therapy and diagnostic methods practised on the human or animal body . . . . .	20
C.I.3. Requirements for grant . . . . .	27
C.I.3.a. Novelty, inventive step and industrial application . . . . .	27
C.I.3.a.a. Naturally occurring products . . . . .	27
C.I.3.a.b. Products for use in methods for treatment of the human or animal body by surgery, therapy or diagnostic methods practiced on the human or animal body . . . . .	28
C.I.3.a.c. Processes of analogy . . . . .	28
C.I.3.b. Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	29
C.I.3.b.a. Nucleotide and amino acid sequences . . . . .	37
C.I.3.b.b. Microorganisms . . . . .	38

C.I.3.c.	Priority . . . . .	40
C.I.3.d.	Person skilled in the art . . . . .	43
C.I.3.e.	Claims . . . . .	45
C.I.3.e.a.	Claim categories . . . . .	46
C.I.3.e.b.	Clarity of claims . . . . .	47
C.I.3.e.c.	Support of claims by description . . . . .	49
C.I.3.e.d.	Claims for medicinal products . . . . .	51
C.I.3.e.e.	Unity of invention . . . . .	52
C.I.3.f.	Description . . . . .	54
C.I.3.f.a.	Selection inventions . . . . .	54
C.I.3.f.b.	Divisional applications . . . . .	56
C.I.3.f.c.	Quality and filing of data . . . . .	58
<b>C.II.</b>	<b>Protection under the EU Regulations . . . . .</b>	<b>61</b>
C.II.1.	SPCs . . . . .	61
C.II.2.	Protecting plants under the CPVR . . . . .	66
C.II.2.a.	General background . . . . .	66
C.II.2.b.	Formal and substantive requirements for grant of a new plant variety right; legal recourse . . . . .	67
C.II.2.c.	Form and duration of the Community Plant Variety Right . . . . .	68
<b>D.</b>	<b>Protectable Matter in the Life Sciences . . . . .</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>D.I.</b>	<b>Small Molecules and Polymers . . . . .</b>	<b>71</b>
D.I.1.	Product claims for low molecular products and polymers . . . . .	73
D.I.2.	Process claims for low molecular products and polymers . . . . .	77
D.I.3.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for low molecular products and polymers . . . . .	78
<b>D.II.</b>	<b>Nucleic acids . . . . .</b>	<b>79</b>
D.II.1.	Introduction . . . . .	79
D.II.2.	Protecting nucleic acids under the EPC . . . . .	80
D.II.2.a.	Discoveries . . . . .	80
D.II.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	81
D.II.2.c.	Methods of treatment . . . . .	82
D.II.2.d.	Novelty . . . . .	82
D.II.2.e.	Inventive Step . . . . .	87
D.II.2.f.	Industrial application . . . . .	96
D.II.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	97
D.II.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims . . . . .	106
D.II.2.i.	Product claims for nucleic acids . . . . .	109
D.II.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by functional terms . . . . .	111
D.II.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by part or all of the amino acid sequence of the encoded protein . . . . .	117
D.II.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by part or all of the nucleic acid sequence itself . . . . .	119
D.II.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by parameters . . . . .	122
D.II.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by reference to a deposited microorganism or deposited DNA . . . . .	124
D.II.2.i.f.	Product claims characterizing a nucleic acid by a process for its preparation . . . . .	125
D.II.2.i.g.	Product claims comprising nucleic acids as essential elements . . . . .	127

D.II.2.i.h.	Product claims for certain types of nucleic acids and methods of using same . . . . .	129
D.II.2.j.	Process claims for nucleic acids . . . . .	131
D.II.2.j.a.	Process claims involving genetic engineering or synthesis . . . . .	132
D.II.2.j.b.	Process claims involving isolation from a nucleic acid source . . . . .	132
D.II.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for nucleic acids . . . . .	135
<b>D.III.</b>	<b>Proteins</b> . . . . .	137
D.III.1.	Introduction . . . . .	137
D.III.2.	Protecting proteins under the EPC . . . . .	137
D.III.2.a.	Discoveries . . . . .	138
D.III.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	139
D.III.2.c.	Methods of treatment . . . . .	139
D.III.2.d.	Novelty . . . . .	139
D.III.2.e.	Inventive step . . . . .	145
D.III.2.f.	Industrial application . . . . .	154
D.III.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	156
D.III.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims . . . . .	161
D.III.2.i.	Product claims for proteins . . . . .	166
D.III.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing a protein by functional terms . . . . .	166
D.III.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing a protein by parameters . . . . .	168
D.III.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing a protein by the coding capacity of a certain DNA . . . . .	171
D.III.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing a protein by its structure . . . . .	172
D.III.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing a protein by a process for its preparation . . . . .	175
D.III.2.i.f.	Product claims comprising proteins as essential elements . . . . .	177
D.III.2.j.	Process claims for proteins . . . . .	179
D.III.2.j.a.	Process claims involving isolation from a natural environment . . . . .	179
D.III.2.j.b.	Process claims involving synthesis by recombinant host cells . . . . .	180
D.III.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for proteins . . . . .	183
<b>D.IV.</b>	<b>Antibodies</b> . . . . .	184
D.IV.1.	Introduction . . . . .	184
D.IV.2.	Protecting antibodies under the EPC . . . . .	184
D.IV.2.a.	Discoveries . . . . .	185
D.IV.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	186
D.IV.2.c.	Methods of treatment . . . . .	186
D.IV.2.d.	Novelty . . . . .	186
D.IV.2.e.	Inventive Step . . . . .	189
D.IV.2.f.	Industrial application . . . . .	195
D.IV.2.g.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	195
D.IV.2.h.	Clarity and support of claims . . . . .	200
D.IV.2.i.	Product claims for antibodies . . . . .	203
D.IV.2.i.a.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by functional terms . . . . .	205
D.IV.2.i.b.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by parameters . . . . .	209
D.IV.2.i.c.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by the coding sequence of a certain DNA . . . . .	210
D.IV.2.i.d.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by its structure . . . . .	210
D.IV.2.i.e.	Product claims characterizing an antibody by a process for its preparation . . . . .	213
D.IV.2.i.f.	Product claims comprising antibodies as essential elements . . . . .	215
D.IV.2.j.	Process claims for antibodies . . . . .	216
D.IV.2.j.a.	Process claims involving isolation from a natural environment . . . . .	216

D.IV.2.j.b.	Process claims involving synthesis by a recombinant host cell . . . . .	216
D.IV.2.j.c.	Process claims involving secretion by hybridomas . . . . .	217
D.IV.2.k.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for antibodies . . . . .	218
<b>D.V.</b>	<b>Microorganisms</b> . . . . .	219
D.V.1.	Introduction . . . . .	219
D.V.2.	Protecting microorganisms under the EPC . . . . .	219
D.V.2.a.	Discoveries . . . . .	220
D.V.2.b.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	221
D.V.2.c.	Methods of treatment . . . . .	221
D.V.2.d.	Novelty . . . . .	221
D.V.2.e.	Inventive step . . . . .	222
D.V.2.e.a.	Inventive step in cases where the microorganism is a hybridoma . . . . .	222
D.V.2.e.b.	Inventive step in cases where the microorganism is not a hybridoma . . . . .	224
D.V.2.f.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	226
D.V.2.f.a.	Necessity of a deposit . . . . .	226
D.V.2.f.b.	Other requirements for sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	229
D.V.2.f.c.	Reproducibility with certainty . . . . .	233
D.V.2.g.	Clarity and support of claims . . . . .	235
D.V.2.g.a.	Functional features in claims . . . . .	235
D.V.2.g.b.	Clarity and the view of the skilled person . . . . .	236
D.V.2.h.	Product claims for microorganisms . . . . .	238
D.V.2.h.a.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by functional terms . . . . .	239
D.V.2.h.b.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by a certain DNA or plasmid . . . . .	240
D.V.2.h.c.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by parameters . . . . .	242
D.V.2.h.d.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by a process for its preparation . . . . .	243
D.V.2.h.e.	Product claims characterizing a microorganism by its deposit number . . . . .	244
D.V.2.i.	Process claims for microorganisms . . . . .	245
D.V.2.i.a.	Process claims for preparing a microorganism . . . . .	245
D.V.2.i.b.	Process claims involving use of a microorganism . . . . .	248
D.V.2.j.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for microorganisms . . . . .	251
<b>D.VI.</b>	<b>Plants</b> . . . . .	252
D.VI.1.	Introduction . . . . .	252
D.VI.2.	Protecting plants under the EPC . . . . .	253
D.VI.2.a.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	253
D.VI.2.b.	Plant varieties and essentially biological processes . . . . .	253
D.VI.2.b.a.	Plant varieties . . . . .	254
D.VI.2.b.b.	Essentially biological processes . . . . .	256
D.VI.2.c.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	260
D.VI.2.d.	Clarity and support of claims . . . . .	264
D.VI.2.e.	Natural plants . . . . .	266
D.VI.2.e.a.	Product claims for natural plants . . . . .	266
D.VI.2.e.b.	Process claims for natural plants . . . . .	270
D.VI.2.e.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for natural plants . . . . .	273
D.VI.2.f.	Hybrid plants . . . . .	274
D.VI.2.f.a.	Product claims for hybrid plants . . . . .	274
D.VI.2.f.b.	Process claims for hybrid plants . . . . .	276
D.VI.2.f.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for hybrid plants . . . . .	278

D.VI.2.g.	Transgenic plants . . . . .	278
D.VI.2.g.a.	Product claims for transgenic plants . . . . .	278
D.VI.2.g.b.	Process claims for transgenic plants . . . . .	284
D.VI.2.g.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for transgenic plants . . . . .	288
D.VI.2.h.	Parts of plants . . . . .	288
D.VI.2.h.a.	Highly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	290
D.VI.2.h.a.a.	Product claims for highly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	290
D.VI.2.h.a.b.	Process claims for highly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	292
D.VI.2.h.a.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for highly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	294
D.VI.2.h.b.	Undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	295
D.VI.2.h.b.a.	Product claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	295
D.VI.2.h.b.b.	Process claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	298
D.VI.2.h.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for undifferentiated or poorly differentiated parts of plants . . . . .	299
D.VI.2.i.	Summary . . . . .	299
<b>D.VII.</b>	<b>Animals</b> . . . . .	300
D.VII.1.	Introduction . . . . .	300
D.VII.2.	Protecting animals under the EPC . . . . .	301
D.VII.2.a.	Sufficiency of disclosure . . . . .	302
D.VII.2.b.	Natural animals . . . . .	303
D.VII.2.b.a.	Product claims for natural animals . . . . .	303
D.VII.2.b.b.	Process claims for natural animals . . . . .	305
D.VII.2.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for natural animals . . . . .	309
D.VII.2.c.	Transgenic animals . . . . .	311
D.VII.2.c.a.	Product claims for transgenic animals . . . . .	311
D.VII.2.c.a.a.	Morality and “ordre public” . . . . .	311
D.VII.2.c.a.b.	Animal varieties and essentially biological processes . . . . .	315
D.VII.2.c.b.	Process claims for transgenic animals . . . . .	318
D.VII.2.c.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for transgenic animals . . . . .	321
D.VII.2.d.	Parts of animals . . . . .	322
D.VII.2.d.a.	Product claims for parts of animals . . . . .	322
D.VII.2.d.b.	Process claims for parts of animals . . . . .	324
D.VII.2.d.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for parts of animals . . . . .	327
D.VII.2.e.	Summary . . . . .	328
<b>D.VIII.</b>	<b>Human Body</b> . . . . .	329
D.VIII.1.	Introduction . . . . .	329
D.VIII.2.	Protecting the human body under the EPC . . . . .	329
D.VIII.2.a.	Human body . . . . .	330
D.VIII.2.a.a.	Product claims for the human body . . . . .	330
D.VIII.2.a.b.	Process claims for the human body . . . . .	330
D.VIII.2.a.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for the human body . . . . .	332
D.VIII.2.b.	Parts of the human body . . . . .	333
D.VIII.2.b.a.	Product claims for parts of the human body . . . . .	333
D.VIII.2.b.b.	Process claims for parts of the human body . . . . .	335
D.VIII.2.b.c.	Use claims/purpose-limited product claims for parts of the human body . . . . .	337
D.VIII.2.b.d.	Human stem cells . . . . .	337
D.VIII.2.b.d.a.	Introduction . . . . .	337

D.VIII.2.b.d.b.	Totipotent human stem cells	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.c.	Pluripotent human stem cells	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.d.	Cells obtained by somatic cellular nuclear transfer (SCNT)	339
D.VIII.2.b.d.e.	Stem cells obtained by parthenogenesis	340
D.VIII.2.b.d.f.	Adult stem cells	340
D.VIII.2.b.d.g.	Examples for allowed claims in the field of human stem cells	340
D.VIII.2.c	Summary	342
<b>E.</b>	<b>Patent Infringement</b>	343
<b>E.I.</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	343
E.I.1.	Pre-Suit Considerations	343
E.I.2.	Cross-Border Issues	345
E.I.2.a.	General Principles – limited territorial reach	345
E.I.2.b.	Cross-Border Injunction	346
E.I.2.c.	Torpedo Actions	347
<b>E.II.</b>	<b>Scope of Protection</b>	348
E.II.1.	Claim Construction and Literal Infringement	348
E.II.2.	Equivalent Infringement and Purposive Construction	350
E.II.3.	Specific Claim Categories	355
E.II.3.a.	Product Claims/Compound Claims	355
E.II.3.b.	Composition claims	356
E.II.3.c.	Product-by-Process Claims	357
E.II.3.d.	(Second Medical) Use Claims/“Off label” Use	358
E.II.3.e.	Companion Diagnostic Claims	361
E.II.3.f.	Screening Processes and Reach Through Claims	356
E.II.3.g.	SPCs	365
E.II.3.h.	Plant Variety Rights	366
E.II.4.	Effects of the Patent – Overview	367
E.II.5.	Issues particular to the life sciences	368
E.II.5.a.	Bolar Provision	368
E.II.5.b.	Experimental Use	371
E.II.5.c.	Research Tools	372
E.II.5.d.	EU Biotech Directive	373
E.II.5.e.	Limitations of patent protection available to gene sequences – the Monsanto decision	374
<b>E.III.</b>	<b>Enforcement options</b>	375
E.III.1.	Introduction	375
E.III.2.	Cease and Desist Letter	375
E.III.3.	Criminal Proceedings	375
E.III.4.	Border Seizure	376
E.III.5.	Decision on the merits	377
E.III.5.a.	Bifurcation	377
E.III.5.b.	Discovery	378
E.III.5.c.	Preliminary Relief/Preliminary Injunctions	379
<b>E.IV.</b>	<b>Antitrust</b>	382
E.IV.1.	Introduction	382
E.IV.2.	Sector Inquiry (Pharmaceuticals)	383
E.IV.3.	“Pay-for-delay”/Lundbeck decision	384
<b>E.V.</b>	<b>Unitary Patent and Unified Patent Court</b>	385
E.V.1.	Introduction	385
E.V.2.	Language	385

E.V.3.	Unified Patent Court . . . . .	386
E.V.3.a.	Introduction . . . . .	386
E.V.3.b.	Structure . . . . .	386
E.V.3.c.	Jurisdiction . . . . .	387
E.V.3.d.	Transitional Period and “opt out” . . . . .	388
E.V.3.e.	Panels . . . . .	389
E.V.4.	Sources of Law . . . . .	389
E.V.5.	Provisional Measures . . . . .	390
E.V.6.	Parties and their Representation before the UPC . . . . .	390
E.V.7.	Procedural Issues . . . . .	391
<b>Annexes</b>		
Annex 1	EPC: Articles . . . . .	393
Annex 2	EPC: Rules – Patentability . . . . .	400
Annex 3	EPC: Rules – Biological sequences . . . . .	402
Annex 4	EPC: Rules – Biological deposits . . . . .	410
Annex 5	EPC: Rules – Form of claims . . . . .	413
Annex 6	EU-Directive 98/44/EC – Biotech Directive . . . . .	415
Annex 7	EU Regulations on SPCs (Medicinal products/Plant protection products) . . . . .	419
Annex 8	EU and international regulations relating to plant varieties . . . . .	421
Annex 9	Bolar Directives . . . . .	433
Annex 10	Register of cited decisions . . . . .	434
<b>Index</b>	. . . . .	443